



Einar Braathen

Parties, Citizens and Local Elections in Mozambique 2003

Working
Paper
2004:129

Title: **Parties, Citizens and Local Elections in Mozambique 2003**

Author: Einar Braathen

NIBR Working Paper: 2004:129

ISSN: 0801-1702

ISBN: 82-7071-522-0

Project number: 0-2160

Project name: Parties, Citizens and Local Elections in Mozambique 2003

Financial supporter NORAD and the Royal Norwegian Embassy in Mozambique

Head of project: Einar Braathen

Abstract: The paper is based on a study before, during and after the second local elections held in Mozambique, November 19, 2003. Field work was carried out in four municipalities and a citizen survey conducted in eight municipalities. The paper concludes that the superior (and to some extent illegitimate) logistic capacity of the ruling Frelimo party, in combination with its better organised connections with segments of the citizenry due to the municipal power in its hands the last five years, affected the local election results. Frelimo managed much more than Renamo to mobilise its potential voters. However, low confidence in the performance capacity of the municipal system and its leaders, contributed to the low voter turn-out (of 26 percent)

Summary: English

Date: December 2004

Pages: 19

Publisher: Norwegian Institute for Urban and Regional Research
Gautstadalléen 21, Box 44, Blindern
N-0313 OSLO
Telephone (+47) 22 95 88 00
Telefax (+47) 22 22 37 02
E-mail: nibr@nibr.no
<http://www.nibr.no>

Printed: Nordberg A.S.

Org. nr. NO 970205284 MVA
© NIBR 2004

Preface

This draft report is the result of a study within the Framework Agreement between NIBR and the Norwegian Agency for Development Cooperation (Norad) for 2003 and 2004. Einar Braathen and NIBR was invited by a team of Mozambican researchers headed by Professor Luis de Brito to cooperate in a research project under the umbrella title 'Parties, Citizens and Local Elections in Mozambique 2003'. Special thanks are extended to Dr. Bernhard Weimer and SDC for facilitating this cooperation, and to the Royal Norwegian Embassy in Maputo, represented by Mr. Jan Arne Munkebye (Minister Counsellor) and Mr. Håvard Hoksnes (First Secretary), for providing funding and support to NIBR's part of that cooperation.

Parallel to this report, Einar Braathen has been involved in a related project, 'Changes in Local Governance' which looks into non-municipalised spheres – rural areas and sub-district levels (townships/villages). Nonetheless, both projects follow-up research in 1994-99 on the local government reform, funded by the Norwegian Research Council - the PRIGOLO project headed by Braathen.¹ That work was accompanied by observation of the first-ever local elections in 1998² and the second general elections in 1999. The field work underpinning this report was to a large extent carried out in the Cabo Delgado province due to the new UNCDF-coordinated programme for district planning and development in this province and in Nampula, partially funded by the Norwegian government.

Mr. Custódio Judião, at the Universidade Católica de Moçambique (UCM) Faculty on Tourism, Management and Informatics in Pemba has been an excellent technical partner in the project. Mr. Judião was one of the main UCM assistants to the PRIGOLO project in 1997-99. Due to the fact that the necessary field supervision capacity, the data software (SPSS) and the data processing capacities are already in place with the Universidade Católica de Moçambique, thanks to their active role in the PRIGOLO and OIE projects 1997-99, the Citizen Survey that forms a key part of this project could be carried out very cost efficiently. Mr. Aslak Orre has been in charge of the SPSS analysis and the crosstabulations that are presented in this report. Dr. Siri Lange has contributed with an observation report from Ilha de Moçambique.

¹ PRIGOLO: 'Projecto de Investigação sobre a Reforma de Governação'; 'Research project on the reform of local governance' in Mozambique'. It was funded by the Research Council of Norway (programme on public administration in developing countries, 1995-99).

² The observation of the local elections in 1998 was supported by a separate project, complementary to PRIGOLO, called 'Observação e Investigação das Eleições', OIE. It was funded by the Royal Norwegian Embassy in Maputo and carried out by the Universidade Católica de Moçambique.

It is our hope that the study might provide some inputs to a wider assessment of the political, administrative and social development in one of Africa's main recipients of international (and Norwegian) aid.

Oslo, December 2004

Arne Tesli
Research Director

Table of Contents

Preface	1
Tables.....	4
Summary	5
1 Introduction.....	7
1.1 The context of the study	7
1.2 The methodology.....	8
2 The election results	10
2.1 The voter turn-out.....	10
2.2 Allocation of votes	11
3 The local elections assessed.....	13
3.1 Neutral electoral administration?	13
3.2 Fair party competition?	14
3.3 Prior increase in citizens' direct participation?	15
3.4 Prior improvement in municipal performance?.....	16
4 Conclusive remarks.....	18

Tables

Table 2.1	Voter turn-out in Mozambican local elections in 1998 and 2003	10
Table 2.2	The allocation of votes in three municipalities	11
Table 3.1	Extent of fair elections according to the citizens	13
Table 3.2	Citizens' participation in associations and municipal affairs	15
Table 3.3	Citizens' participation in political action	16
Table 3.4	Citizens' satisfaction with different public services.....	16
Table 3.5	Citizens' satisfaction with the municipality/mayor.....	17

Summary

Einar Braathen

Parties, Citizens and Local Elections in Mozambique 2003

Working Paper 2004:129

The paper reports on the second local elections held in Mozambique, November 19, 2003.

Three sets of concerns provide the context of the study: First, the political parties after 1999. The relationship between the two main parties, Frelimo and Renamo, have been very tense and led to some serious eruptions of violence. This 'undeclared war' situation has not been conducive to the development of a civic culture and democracy within the parties. Second, the citizens' mobilisation and role of civil society. The murder of the independent and investigative journalist Carlos Cardoso, who also represented an independent citizen list in the Maputo City Council, have raised concerns for press freedom and capacity of civil society to be a watchdog for the new and fragile democracy. Third, the political will to decentralise, to devolve power to elected local authorities and to empower civil society. Elected self-government (municipality) was introduced only in ten selected rural towns, in addition to the 23 cities, in 1998. The government policy was to gradually expand elected self-government to other towns and to rural areas. However, no progress had been made in this field before the second local elections.

The study included the following types of data collection: Shorter visits with face-to-face interviews with a small panel of people before and after the elections in four selected municipalities; observation of the election administration, electoral campaign and election day in three municipalities; and a citizens survey in eight different municipalities.

Two outcomes of the elections are tried explained. First, the low average turn-out. Only 26.16 % of the registered voters participated in the elections. Second, the overwhelming victory of the Frelimo party. Frelimo won with large a majority in 28 of the 33 municipalities. The analysis is clustered around five research themes and concludes with then following:

- (i) The electoral administration carried out the elections, including its preparations, in a relatively neutral (non-partisan), effective and transparent way.
- (ii) However, although inter-party competition was predominantly non-violent, it had not been fair. There was no 'even-levelled' the playing field. The ruling party, Frelimo, used public resources including staff and vehicles in its campaign been even-levelled, making it extremely superior in the capacity to reach and mobilise its voters. Renamo managed to mobilise much less of the voters they had gained in the prior (general) elections in 1999.
- (iii) Moreover, since the first municipal elections in 1998, the Frelimo party – who ruled all the municipalities – had been capable of involving a high number of

citizens in the municipal affairs. This also helped to support the Frelimo mobilisation for votes.

- (iv) Still, since the first municipal elections in 1998, the performance of the municipalities have not improved enough to increase the citizens' trust in the municipal system.

In sum, the superior (and to some extent illegitimate) logistic capacity of the ruling Frelimo party, in combination with its better organised connections with segments of the citizenry due to the municipal power in its hands the last five years, affected the local election results. Frelimo managed much more than Renamo to mobilise its potential voters. However, low confidence in the performance capacity of the municipal system and its leaders, contributed to a low voter turn-out.

1 Introduction

Mozambique celebrated in October 2002 ten years of peace (absence of civil war), and in 2004 the country can be congratulated with ten years of multi-party elections. Decentralisation and local governance reforms have been part of the combined peace, reconciliation and democratisation efforts, on the one hand, and economic-social post conflict reconstruction, on the other.

Radical constitutional and legal changes made from 1994 to 1997 paved the way for the introduction of elected self-government (municipalities) in the 23 cities and in ten selected rural towns in 1998. However, these elections were boycotted by Renamo and smaller opposition parties due to controversies on the preparations and administration of the elections. The voter turn-out was only 14.6 %.

Research on these elections show that the high abstention rate was partly a vote of citizens protest against the political parties and partly a symptom of voter's apathy and low civic-educational level.. In general, consolidation of the democracy requires for example a non-disputed (or neutral) electoral administration, a non-violent competition between political parties, and a high degree of citizens participation and trust in the political system. The local elections in Mozambique 2003 may be seen as a test of the consolidation of democracy in this country.

The second local elections were set for November 19, 2003.

1.1 The context of the study

Three sets of concerns provide the context of the study in this report:

First, the political parties and the aftermath of the general elections in 1999. Although these elections saw the full participation of the opposition, the count and results of these elections have to date *not* been recognised by Renamo and allied parties. They held national protest demonstrations against the 1999 elections as late as in November 2000, leading to the tragic deaths of 90 persons in Montepuez. The relationship between Frelimo and Renamo at all levels have remained tense since that. This 'undeclared war' situation has not been conducive to the development of a civic culture and democracy *within* the parties³. The processes of nominating the candidates for the local elections and the following electoral inter-party competition may provide new insights into the extent of progress of the democratic culture in Mozambique's political society.

Second, the citizens' mobilisation and role of civil society. Another tragic event in November 2000, the murder of investigative journalist Carlos Cardoso, raised concern in

³ See efforts by AWEPA and other international NGOs or organisations to contribute to this crucial, but often neglected role of the parties and their internal functioning in the democratisation process.

the civil society. Mr. Cardoso was himself an important organiser of civil society, trying to promote independent media that could serve as critical watchdogs of corruption, mismanagement and abuse of power. He was one of the founders of the independent citizens' list that stood for the Maputo municipal elections, and he was elected a member of the municipal assembly. His death highlights the role of independent citizens in central and local governance. An important idea stemming from Mr. Cardoso was to let the presidents of the electoral commissions at all levels (district/city, provincial and national) to be nominated by the civil society. This idea has been adopted and implemented this year. This innovation might have enhanced the participation of independent lists and confidence of the citizens in the administration of the elections.

Third, the political will to decentralise, to devolve power to elected local authorities and to empower civil society. The introduction of elected self-government (municipalities) in ten selected rural towns, in addition to the 23 cities, in 1998 left open the issue of local democracy in the rural districts. After the ruling Frelimo Party chose Mr. Armando Guebuza as its new leader and president candidate, it was announced that the next local elections would not see any expansion of local-self government into new districts, counter to all the previous policy statements since 1994. In the donor community, there might be concerns that the recent policy decisions might hamper on-going poverty reduction programmes among the rural majority of Mozambique's population. More evidence-based information about the achievements of the municipalities, and in particular of the rural town municipalities at the local level, might contribute to the further public discussions about reforms in the central-local relations and in the local government system.

Thus, the study wants to explore the relationships between parties, citizens and electoral institutions. The latter include the election administration, the environment for informed public discussions, and the extent of even-levelled playing fields for the parties, lists and candidates competing for the citizens' votes.

1.2 The methodology

The research questions have been the following:

1. Has the electoral administration carried out the elections, including its preparations, in a neutral (non-partisan), effective and transparent manner?⁴
2. Has inter-party competition been non-violent and fair, and has the playing field been even-levelled?
3. Since the first municipal elections in 1998, have the political parties and municipal leaders been involved in achieving higher citizens' participation⁵ in the municipal affairs?

⁴ 'Electoral administration' here refers to the local branches of STAE and CNE, respectively: their selection of civil society and party representatives in leading functions; their voter registration and voter education activities; their co-operation with civil society organisations in the latter activities; as well as their preparations to make the voting and counting stages free, fair and transparent.

⁵ E.g. through participatory planning, democratically elected and representative leaders at the township (bairro), regularised consultation of the municipal representatives directly with the population or with representatives of local civil society, participation of the citizens directly (through street and township/bairro structures) or through NGOs in service delivery,

4. Since the first municipal elections in 1998, has the performance of the municipalities⁶ improved, and has the performance affected the citizens' trust in the municipal system?
5. Have any of the mentioned aspects, or a conjunction of them, affected the local election results in terms of voter turn-out and allocation of votes?

The study included the following types of data collection:

- I Shorter visits with face-to-face interviews with a small panel of people⁷ before and after the elections (in September, October-November, and December-January, respectively);
- II Observation of the election administration, electoral campaign and election day⁸;
- III A citizens survey⁹. In total 1778 citizens in 8 different municipalities – Pemba, Montepuez, Beira, Dondo, Chimoio, Xai-Xai, Mandlakaze, Catandica - served as respondents. The procedures for selecting the respondents were: cluster sampling (one cluster usually equalled one bairro; 3-5 clusters in each municipality, reflecting the socio-economic varieties of the municipality) and a combination of quota (men/women, younger/older citizens) and random individual sampling.

This report is based on the field work and electoral observation in three selected case municipalities: Pemba, Montepuez and Ilha de Moçambique. The latter municipality was not part of the citizen survey. Pemba and Montepuez, however, represent the span of variations between urban and more rural municipalities and other variations found among the 8 municipalities in the survey.

⁶ 'Municipal performance' refers to the performance in service delivery, tax collection, revenue raising, financial and other management characteristics.

⁷ E.g., presidents and vice-presidents (from Renamo and Frelimo) of the local electoral commission, all the candidates for the mayor election, candidates from all parties/lists presented to the municipal assembly election, members of civil society, a few chosen ordinary citizens/families.

⁸ Indirect observation only, from outside the polling stations. Direct observation within the polling stations – of the voting, counting and verification processes – is desirable, but it depends on arrangements to give the Norwegian researchers a legal status as International Election Observers.

⁹ The citizens survey will be a replica of the PRIGOLO surveys in 1997 and 1999.

2 The election results

The second-ever local elections (*Eleições Autárquicas*) in Mozambique were carried out in 33 municipalities on November 29, 2003. The count and its final verification led to the identification by mass media and informed observers of two main results:

- First, the low average turn-out. Only 26.16 % of the registered voters turned out for the polling stations. Although it was much better than the 14.6 % turn-out five years earlier, and although turn-out is ‘normally’ lower in the local elections than in the national (general and president) elections in most democracies, the turn-out leaves a lot to desire.
- Second, the overwhelming victory of the Frelimo party. Frelimo won with large majorities in 28 municipalities. Renamo won with in 4 municipalities – Nacala, Angoche, Ilha de Moçambique and Beira. In one municipality, Marromeu, it was a very close race with Renamo winning the mayor elections and Frelimo the municipal assembly elections.

2.1 The voter turn-out

Table 2.1 *Voter turn-out in Mozambican local elections in 1998 and 2003*

		Voters registered	Votes cast	Voter turn- out, %
Pemba				
	1998	42 337	8 721	20.6
	2003	54 115	16 118	29.7
	<i>Increase</i>	28 %	85 %	(44 %)
Montepuez				
	1998	25 610	11 473	44.8
	2003	28 674	11 914	41.5
	<i>Increase</i>	12 %	4 %	(- 7 %)
Ilha de Moçambique				
	1998			
	2003	27 049	8 684	32.1
	<i>Increase</i>			
All Mozambique				
	1998			14.58
	2003	2 371 839	573 140	26.16
	<i>Increase</i>			(78 %)

Source: The PRIGOLO Citizen Survey (2003)

Voters registered. 1998: CNE. 2003: Number of voters published by CNE August 20, 2003. By J. Hanlon in MPPB # 29 considered to be more accurate than the final figure posted by CNE December 9, 2003. .

Votes cast. For the Municipal Assembly election (not the Mayor election). Valid, spoiled and blank votes. 1998: estimate, calculated on the basis of known turn-out percentage. 2003: CNE

Voter turn-out. 1998: CNE. 2003: calculated on the basis of the figures explained above. Increase: 'Absolute' increase in number of voters registered and votes cast; 'relative' increase in the turn-out rate.

As we can see, the voter turn-out in Montepuez (41.5%) in 2003 is far above the country average (26.16 %). Actually, Montepuez had one of the highest turn-outs in the country. Only Moatize (47%), Mocimboa da Praia (46%), Chokwe (45 %) and Catandica (43 %) were higher. However, Montepuez falls a bit behind compared to 1998, when the turn-out was 44.8 % and beaten only by Dondo. In relative terms, Montepuez saw a 7 % *decrease* in the turn-out rate, while the country in average saw a 78 % increase. There might be two reasons for this: First, due to the 'November 2000' events many people might want to withdraw from politics and avoid (re-)register and/or vote. Taken into consideration the seriousness of these events, the 'withdrawal-from-politics' effect could be expected to be even higher. Second, from 1998 to at least 2001 there have been a down-turn in the outputs and prices of the cotton market, which is important for the local economy. The cotton factory, Lomaco, was closed down (although reopened by new owners). These uncertainties might have created some migration from Montepuez to e.g. Pemba and other cities and affected the number of voters registered and/or being present to vote.

Pemba is overtaken by the mainstream of the municipalities in the elections in 2003. In 1998 its turn-out was well ahead the national average, while in 2003 it was just slightly above the average. Nevertheless, in absolute terms, it increased the number of votes cast by 83 %. Due to a high increase in the number of registered voters, this did not produce a similar increase in the turn-out rate.

2.2 Allocation of votes

Table 2.2 *The allocation of votes in three municipalities*

	Pemba	Montepuez	Ilha de Moç.	Note
Frelimo				
<i>Mayor 2003,</i>	10 230 (66.86 %)	8 589 (79.80 %)	2 543 (33.12 %)	a)
<i>Assembly 2003</i>	9 882 (65.51 %)	8 533 (80.21 %)	2 700 (36.45 %)	
<i>Assembly 1998</i>	6 817	8 652		
<i>1998-2003 increase</i>	45 %	- 1.4 %		b)
Renamo				
<i>Mayor 2003</i>	4 421 (28.89 %)	2 174 (20.20 %)	4 082 (53.10 %)	a)
<i>Assembly 2003</i>	4 546 (30.14 %)	2 105 (19.79 %)	3 902 (52.68 %)	
Others				
<i>Mayor 2003</i>	650 (4.25 %)		1 054 (13.75 %)	c)
<i>Assembly 2003</i>	657 (4.36 %)		805 (10.87 %)	d)

Source: The PRIGOLO Citizen Survey (2003)

Notes:

a) The CNE figures published in 'Eleições Moçambicanas' Janeiro 2004 present wrong numbers for the mayor elections in Pemba. The votes there sum up to 103 %, because the Frelimo candidate is attributed 69.82 % of the votes – 4 % more than Frelimo got in the Assembly ballot – instead of the correct number: 66.86 % (based on the number of 'valid votes being 15 301).

b) Increase of absolute number of votes received. Can only be measured for Frelimo, since Renamo boycotted the 1998 elections.

c) In Pemba an independent, Mr. Fabião Namiva, stood for the mayor elections. He was supported by IPAD. In Ilha de Moçambique, the independent candidate was Mr. Jorge Simões supported by UPI, Unidos pela Ilha.

d) In Pemba, there were two small parties presenting lists for the municipal assembly election: PT (Partido do Trabalho) got 357 votes (2.37 %) and PIMO (Partido da Independência de Moçambique) got 300 votes (1.99 %). In Ilha de Moçambique, the independent Unidos pela Ilha got 533 votes (7.20 %) and one of the 21 seats in the assembly. PIMO got 272 votes (3.67 %).

Frelimo won overwhelmingly in Montepuez and Pemba. Compared to the 1999 general elections, Renamo did much worse than expected and Frelimo much better. Frelimo's absolute number of figures increased by 45 % in Pemba and decreased by 4 % in Montepuez. These differences in voter mobilisation should be interpreted in the light of what is discussed above..

The variations between votes cast for Frelimo's mayor candidate and Frelimo's list for the municipal assembly are quite marginal.. The variations may be explained in two ways: (i) there are to random variations of votes declared invalid (nulo), (ii) some mayoral candidates more popular (or unpopular) than their party lists. (Frelimos mayor candidate in Pemba, Mr. Agostinho Ntauali got 348 more votes than the party, while its candidate in Montepuez, Mr. Rafael Correia, got 63 only 63 more votes than party. As our analysis of the citizen survey will show, this does not mean that has Mr. Ntauali was very popular or Mr. Correia less popular. Rather to the contrary, our survey data point in the opposite direction.

Pemba and Ilha de Moçambique saw independent mayor candidate and more parties/lists contesting. In Pemba, Mr. Fabião Namiva, who was supported by IPAD, got 4.25 % and the two small partiets PT and PIMO together 4.36 % of the valid votes. In Ilha de Moçambique, In Ilha de Moçambique, the independent candidate was Mr. Jorge Simões who also was the head of an independent citizens list, , Unidos pela Ilha (UPI). Mr. Simões got 14 % of the votes. For the municipal assembly, UPI got 533 votes (7.20 %) and one of the 21 seats in the assembly. PIMO got 272 votes (3.67 %). The independent candidates and lists, and smaller parties, were quite disappointed with their low capture of votes. In both Pemba and Ilha de Moçambique the independent mayor candidates carried out energetic campaigns with young and well-educated citizens.

3 The local elections assessed

3.1 Neutral electoral administration?

Has the electoral administration carried out the elections, including its preparations, in a neutral (non-partisan), effective and transparent manner? ¹⁰

In the citizen survey, we asked the respondents ‘do you think that the municipal elections on the 19th of November this year were fair (Justas)?’ The answers were as follows:

Table 3.1 *Extent of fair elections according to the citizens*

			acha que as eleições autárquicas de 19 de Nov deste ano foram conduzidas de maneira justa?				Total
			completam ente justas	Justas, mas com alguns problemas	muito injustas	nao sabe	
Cidade de entrevista	Pemba	Count	88	48	10	54	200
		% within Cidade de entrevista	44,0%	24,0%	5,0%	27,0%	100,0%
	Montepuez	Count	142	19	4	35	200
		% within Cidade de entrevista	71,0%	9,5%	2,0%	17,5%	100,0%
	Beira	Count	76	160	29	53	318
		% within Cidade de entrevista	23,9%	50,3%	9,1%	16,7%	100,0%
	Dondo	Count	115	53	9	35	212
		% within Cidade de entrevista	54,2%	25,0%	4,2%	16,5%	100,0%
	Chimoio	Count	116	74	23	42	255
		% within Cidade de entrevista	45,5%	29,0%	9,0%	16,5%	100,0%
	Xai-xai	Count	91	61	8	39	199
		% within Cidade de entrevista	45,7%	30,7%	4,0%	19,6%	100,0%
	Manjacaze	Count	105	37	15	24	181
		% within Cidade de entrevista	58,0%	20,4%	8,3%	13,3%	100,0%
	Catandica	Count	163	27	1	18	209
		% within Cidade de entrevista	78,0%	12,9%	,5%	8,6%	100,0%
Total		Count	896	479	99	300	1774
		% within Cidade de entrevista	50,5%	27,0%	5,6%	16,9%	100,0%

Source: The PRIGOLO Citizen Survey (2003)

¹⁰ ‘Electoral administration’ here refers to the local branches of STAE and CNE, respectively: their selection of civil society and party representatives in leading functions; their voter registration and voter education activities; their co-operation with civil society organisations in the latter activities; as well as their preparations to make the voting and counting stages free, fair and transparent.

Legend: 'Cidade de entrevista' – city of location for interviews; 'completamente justas' – completely fair; 'justas, mas com alguns problemas' – fair, however with some problems; 'muito injustas' – very unfair; 'nao sabe' – does not know.

As we see, in all municipalities between 70 and 80 % of the respondents think that the elections were fair. Only in Beira, a majority think that the elections were fair although with 'some problems' – understandable, given the conflicts within the local STAE/CNE in the counting and verification processes the days after the elections. In no municipality there were more than 9 % thinking the elections were 'very unfair'.

The observations made by this study support these popular perceptions. The local Electoral Commissions carried out their duties transparently and without delays due to deep conflicts. Renamo delegates reported some grievances against the voter registration – that many people were given double electoral cards, or electoral cards in spite of not being resident of the municipality. Whatever substance in these grievances, these incidents could not have been big enough to change but small and completely insignificant margins of the election results.

A more important grievance has been against the civic education of STAE. In spite of good access to resources and 1200 'agentes' visiting people's neighbourhoods in the 33 municipalities, very few people asked could tell the *meaning* of the municipal elections – what the elected leaders should be expected to do for the population, given present legal set-ups and financial conditions. However, the majority knew well about the existence and date of the elections.

Civic education about the technicalities of voting were also in place, although many people were confused about the location of their polling-stations (some of them being moved since the general elections in 1999 or not being identical with the location of the voter registration brigade). The chairmen of the polling stations gave every voter a detailed description about how to vote. In spite of this, 13 % of the votes in Ilha de Moçambique were nullified. In Pemba it was 2.7 % and in Montepuez 4.4. % - probably reflecting a higher general level of education.

3.2 Fair party competition?

Has inter-party competition been non-violent and fair, and has the playing field been even-levelled?

Our observations are clearly that there was a big inequality between Frelimo and Renamo in the resources provided for their respective campaigns. We may here use the metaphor *Cavalry against Infantry*:

Frelimo represented the cavalry. They carried out their campaign with motorised caravans (five to 20 vehicles were observed each time, in all three municipalities), with transportable public address systems run by mobile diesel generators, and complemented by a fleet of *brigadistas* on bicycle.

Renamo, on the other hand, did nearly all the campaigning on foot, from door to door (porta-a-porta). Its infantry of militants and sympathisers marched through the townships and neighbourhoods, more often than not with leaflets and other items to hand out to interested citizens. Frelimo had t-shirts and more often than not colourful leaflets.

Obviously, when the citizens by themselves are less mobilised and motivated for the elections, such as these, the machinery and capacity of mobilising ‘own’ voters, that depend on vehicles, becomes a crucial factor. Moreover, a large number of the vehicles observed in Frelimo caravans were government or foreign donor/NGO sponsored project vehicles. This represented a systematic abuse of resources for partisan purposes.

3.3 Prior increase in citizens’ direct participation?

Since the first municipal elections in 1998, have the political parties and municipal leaders been involved in achieving higher citizens’ participation¹¹ in the municipal affairs?

Table 3.2 *Citizens’ participation in associations and municipal affairs*

	Pemba	M’puez	All 8	Note
Membro dos associações nacionais / <i>member of a national association (Q30)</i>	7.0	2.0	7.2	
Membro dos associações de moradores ou outras criadas localmente / <i>member of a local association (Q29)</i>	14.1	6.0	10.2	
Alguma autoridade organizou uma reunião, participei / <i>a public authority organised a meeting in my neighbourhood, and I participated (Q15)</i>	15.4	48.5	28.0	
Alguma autoridade me pediu contribuir na melhoria de serviços / <i>a public authority asked me to contribute to improve the services (Q16)</i>	11.9	12.0	13.3	a)
Alguma ONG me pediu contribuir na melhoria de serviços / <i>A NGO asked me to contribute to improve services (Q17)</i>	9.5	1.0	3.9	

Source: The PRIGOLO Citizen Survey (2003) – questions 30, 29, 15, 16 and 17, respectively.

Legend: **All 8** refers to the 8 municipalities represented in the Citizen Survey: Pemba, Montepuez, Beira, Dondo, Chimoio, Xai-Xai, Mandlakaze, Catandica

Note a): In Pemba, 87 percent were asked to contribute with voluntary work and 13 % with monetary contribution (in the eight municipalities 70 % and 24 percent respectively, while 6 % were asked to join an association). In Montepuez 31 percent were asked to contribute with voluntary work and 69 % with monetary contribution.

As we see, only 12 percent of the respondents both in Pemba and Montepuez have been asked to contribute directly to public service delivery. People in Montepuez are much more than in the other seven municipalities consulted or informed directly by a public authority, through participating in meetings. People in Pemba are less so. This might explain some of the high turn-out for the municipal elections in Montepuez

¹¹ E.g. through participatory planning, democratically elected and representative leaders at the township (bairro), regularised consultation of the municipal representatives directly with the population or with representatives of local civil society, participation of the citizens directly (through street and township/bairro structures) or through NGOs in service delivery,

Table 3.3 *Citizens' participation in political action*

	Pemba	M'puez	All 8
Membro das associações nacionais / <i>member of a national association</i> (Q30)	7.0	2.0	7.2
Escrevei uma carta ou falou numa estação de radio / <i>written a public letter or spoken in a radio station</i> (Q31)	8.1	2.5	9.8
Participei num petição contra um assunto que afectasse a minha comunidade / <i>taken part in a petition on an issue affecting my community</i> (Q32)	15.7	3.0	12.9
Participei num protesto ou manifestação contra um assunto que afectasse a minha comunidade / <i>taken part in a protest or demonstration on a similar issue</i> (Q33)	13.1	5.0	12.1
Participei em qualquer renúcio na campanha eleitoral / <i>participated in a municipal election candidate meeting</i> (Q25)	35.4	43.9	41.6
Fiz campanha para algum partido ou candidato / <i>I took part in the campaign for a party or candidate</i> (Q24)	29.6	36.9	28.7

Source: The PRIGOLO Citizen Survey (2003) - questions 30, 31, 32, 33, 25 and 24, respectively.

The percentage of people responding that they have taken part in political meetings and/or in the campaign of a particular party/candidate are incredibly high. They nearly equal the actual turn-out on the election day in the two of municipalities. This may indicate a polarised electorate: a large number of the electorate took very active part in the elections, a majority was completely passive.

3.4 Prior improvement in municipal performance?

Since the first municipal elections in 1998, has the performance of the municipalities¹² improved, and has the performance affected the citizens' trust in the municipal system?

Table 3.4 *Citizens' satisfaction with different public services*

	Pemba	M'puez	All 8
(10.1) Escola Primaria / <i>Primary School</i>	74.1	79.5	81.5
(10.2) Escola Secundária / <i>Secondary School</i>	44.9	40.5	47.6
(10.3) Posto/clínica de saúde / <i>Health Services</i>	34.0	41.0	52.3
(10.4) Abastecimento de agua / <i>Water Services</i>	37.1	26.5	37.3
(10.5) Esgotos, drenagem / <i>Sanitation</i>	24.4	5.0	23.1
(10.6) Recolha de lixo / <i>Garbage Collection</i>	32.5	21.5	30.9
(10.7) Mercado ou praça / <i>Market place conditions</i>	28.9	44.0	44.4
(10.8) Construção de estradas / <i>Road Construction</i>	71.6	12.5	35.0
(10.9) Manutenção de estradas / <i>Road Maintenance</i>	61.9	21.5	36.7
(10.10) Transportes / <i>Transports</i>	48.2	45.5	50.3
(10.11) Assistência agrícola / <i>Agricultural Assistance</i>	20.3	22.0	27.1
(10.12) Energia eléctrica / <i>Electric Energy</i>	18.8	48.0	40.8
(10.13) Manutenção de cemitérios / <i>Cemeteries</i>	21.8	24.5	34.2
(10.14) Segurança publica / <i>Public security</i>	34.5	31.5	38.2

¹² 'Municipal performance' refers to the performance in service delivery, tax collection, revenue raising, financial and other management characteristics.

Source: The PRIGOLO Citizen Survey (2003) - Question 10: “Some people are satisfied with the quality and capacity of certain public services delivered in this district/town/city. Others are dissatisfied. What do you think about the following services.

Percents responding they are ‘satisfeito’ (*satisfied*) with the indicated service (Q 10.1-10.14).

Except for primary education, and in Pemba only for roads, the population in Pemba and Montepuez are more dissatisfied than satisfied with the public service provided. And othey are more dissatisfied than in the other municipalities in the sample. Our own observations indicate that there are good reasons for this dissatisfaction. However, ho does this relate to satisfaction/dissatisfaction with the perceived performance of the local government authorities?

Table 3.5 *Citizens’ satisfaction with the municipality/mayor*

	Pemba	M’puez	All 8
(11) Serviços melhoraram os ultimos cinco anos/ <i>Services improved the last five years</i>	59.5	65.5	59.8
(14) O PCM fiz um esforço muito satisfatório/ <i>The Mayor made a satisfactory effort</i>	25.9	23.0	28.5
(26) O novo CM vai prestar mais atenção do que o antigo / <i>New mayor will be more attentive than the old</i>	24.1	65.5	42.8
(27) O novo CM vai melhorar os serviços publicos / <i>The new Mayor’s team will improve public services</i>	31.7	65.5	47.9
(36) Confio muito no PCM recém eleito / <i>I trust very much the recently elected Mayor</i>	28.5	77.4	41.5
(28) Aceitaria pagar mais impostos ao CM <i>I would accept paying more tax to the municipality</i>	55.0	43.7	53.0
28)pagar / <i>pay</i> sem condições / <i>I would unconditionally accept paying more tax to the municipality</i>	43.0	39.2	35.7

Source: The PRIGOLO Citizen Survey (2003)- questions 11, 14, 26, 27, 36 and 28 respectively. Multiple choice: Percents choosing the cited statements.

As we see, there is a very high degree of approval in both Pemba and Montepuez. In Montepuez, there is an exceptionally high trust in the new elected mayor as to his capability to improve services and pay more attention to the citizens needs.

4 Conclusive remarks

Two outcomes of the elections need explanation. First, the low average turn-out. Only 26.16 % of the registered voters participated in the elections. Second, the overwhelming victory of the Frelimo party. Frelimo won with large a majority in 28 of the 33 municipalities. Our tentative explanations can be summarised in the following way:

- (i) (i) The electoral administration carried out the elections, including its preparations, in a relatively neutral (non-partisan), effective and transparent way.
- (ii) (ii) However, although inter-party competition was predominantly non-violent, it had not been fair. There was no ‘even-levelled’ the playing field. The ruling party, Frelimo, used public resources including staff and vehicles in its campaign been even-levelled, making it extremely superior in the capacity to reach and mobilise its voters. Renamo managed to mobilise much less of the voters they had gained in the prior (general) elections in 1999.
- (iii) (iii) Moreover, since the first municipal elections in 1998, the Frelimo party – who ruled all the municipalities – had been capable of involving a high number of citizens in the municipal affairs. This also helped to support the Frelimo mobilisation for votes.
- (iv) (iv) Still, since the first municipal elections in 1998, the performance of the municipalities have not improved enough to increase the citizens’ trust in the municipal system.

In sum, the superior (and to some extent illegitimate) logistic capacity of the ruling Frelimo party, in combination with its better organised connections with segments of the citizenry due to the municipal power in its hands the last five years, affected the local election results. Frelimo managed much more than Renamo to mobilise its potential voters. However, low confidence in the performance capacity of the municipal system and its leaders, contributed to a low voter turn-out.